| 1 | BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP | MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP | |
|-----|---|--|--|
| 2 | RICHARD J. POCKER (NV Bar No. 3568) | THOMAS S. HIXSON (pro hac vice) KRISTEN A. PALUMBO (pro hac vice) | |
| _ | 300 South Fourth Street, Suite 800 | Three Embarcadero Center | |
| 3 | Las Vegas, NV 89101 Telephone: (702) 382-7300 | San Francisco, CA 94111-4067 | |
| 4 | Facsimile: (702) 382-2755 | Telephone: 415.393.2000 Facsimile: 415.393.2286 | |
| 4 | rpocker@bsfllp.com | thomas.hixson@bingham.com | |
| 5 | | kristen.palumbo@bingham.com | |
| | BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP WILLIAM IS A CSON (pro hac vice) | DODIAN DALEY (pro has viss) | |
| 6 | WILLIAM ISAACSON (pro hac vice) KAREN DUNN (pro hac vice) | DORIAN DALEY (pro hac vice) DEBORAH K. MILLER (pro hac vice) | |
| 7 | 5301 Wisconsin Ave, NW | JAMES C. MAROULIS (pro hac vice) | |
| • | Washington, DC 20015 | ORACLE CORPORATION | |
| 8 | Telephone: (202) 237-2727 | 500 Oracle Parkway, M/S 5op7 | |
| 9 | Facsimile: (202) 237-6131 | Redwood City, CA 94070 Telephone: 650.506.4846 | |
| 9 | wisaacson@bsfllp.com | Facsimile: 650.506.7114 | |
| 10 | kdunn@bsfllp.com | dorian.daley@oracle.com | |
| | BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP | deborah.miller@oracle.com | |
| 11 | STEVEN C. HOLTZMAN (pro hac vice) | jim.maroulis@oracle.com | |
| 12 | KIERAN P. RINGGENBERG (pro hac vice) 1999 Harrison Street, Suite 900 | | |
| | Oakland, CA 94612 | | |
| 13 | Telephone: (510) 874-1000 | | |
| 14 | Facsimile: (510) 874-1460 | | |
| 14 | sholtzman@bsfllp.com kringgenberg@bsfllp.com | | |
| 15 | kiniggenberg@bsinp.com | | |
| 1.0 | Attorneys for Oracle USA, Inc., Oracle | | |
| 16 | America, Inc., and Oracle International | | |
| 17 | Corporation | | |
| 40 | UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT | | |
| 18 | DISTRICT OF NEVADA | | |
| 19 | | | |
| 20 | | | |
| 20 | ORACLE USA, INC., a Colorado corporation; | Case No. 2:10-cv-00106-LRH-PAL | |
| 21 | ORACLE OSA, INC., a Colorado Corporation, ORACLE AMERICA, INC. a Delaware | PLAINTIFFS ORACLE'S MOTION | |
| | corporation; and ORACLE INTERNATIONAL | TO SEAL THEIR OPPOSITION TO | |
| 22 | CORPORATION, a California corporation, | DEFENDANTS RIMINI STREET INC.'S AND SETH RAVIN'S MOTION | |
| 23 | Plaintiffs, | TO BIFURCATE AND SUPPORTING | |
| | V. | DOCUMENTS | |
| 24 | | | |
| 25 | RIMINI STREET, INC., a Nevada corporation; SETH RAVIN, an individual, | Judge: Hon. Larry R. Hicks | |
| 43 | SETTI KAVIIV, ali liluividual, | | |
| 26 | Defendants. | | |
| 27 | | | |
| | | | |
| 28 | | Case No. 2:10-cv-00106-LRH-PAL | |
| | | | |

| 1 | Pursuant to the Stipulated Protective Order governing confidentiality of documents |
|----|---|
| 2 | entered by the Court on May 21, 2010, Dkt. 55 ("Protective Order"), and Rules 5.2 and 26(c) of |
| 3 | the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Plaintiffs Oracle USA, Inc., Oracle America, Inc., and |
| 4 | Oracle International Corporation (together "Oracle" or "Plaintiffs") respectfully request that the |
| 5 | Court order the Clerk of the Court to file under seal an unredacted copy of Oracle's Opposition |
| 6 | to Defendants Rimini Street Inc.'s and Seth Ravin's Motion to Bifurcate ("Opposition") (the |
| 7 | "Opposition") and supporting Exhibits. Unredacted copies of the Opposition and Exhibits were |
| 8 | individually lodged under seal with the Court on July 16, 2015. |
| 9 | Sealing of the unredacted Opposition is requested because the redacted portions of it |
| 10 | contain information that Rimini Street, Inc. and Seth Ravin (collectively the "Defendants"), have |
| 11 | designated as "Confidential Information" and "Highly Confidential Information - Attorneys' |
| 12 | Eyes Only" under the terms of the Protective Order. Likewise, sealing of the unredacted |
| 13 | Exhibits is requested because they contain information designated as "Confidential Information" |
| 14 | and "Highly Confidential Information – Attorneys' Eyes Only" by the Defendants and Oracle. |
| 15 | The Protective Order states, "Counsel for any Designating Party may designate any |
| 16 | Discovery Material as 'Confidential Information' and 'Highly Confidential Information – |
| 17 | Attorneys' Eyes Only' under the terms of this Protective Order only if such counsel in good faith |
| 18 | believes that such Discovery Material contains such information and is subject to protection |
| 19 | under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c). The designation by any Designating Party of any |
| 20 | Discovery Material as 'Confidential Information' or 'Highly Confidential Information – |
| 21 | Attorneys' Eyes Only' shall constitute a representation that an attorney for the Designating Party |
| 22 | reasonably believes there is a valid basis for such designation." Dkt. 55 \P 2. |
| 23 | For sealing requests relating to non-dispositive motions, such as this, the presumption of |
| 24 | public access to court filings may be overcome by a showing of good cause under Rule 26(c). |
| 25 | See Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n, 605 F.3d 665, 678 (9th Cir. 2010); Kamakana v. Honolulu, |
| 26 | |
| 27 | ¹ All Exhibits referred to in this motion are attached to the Appendix of Exhibits Cited in Support of Oracle's Opposition to Rimini Street Inc.'s and Seth Ravin's Motion to Bifurcate. |
| | |

28

- 1 447 F.3d 1172, 1179 (9th Cir. 2006). Defendants have identified the information redacted in the
- 2 Opposition as well as the Exhibits as Confidential and Highly Confidential, and therefore
- 3 Defendants have represented that good cause exists for sealing those portions of the documents.
- 4 This is a sufficient showing of good cause to permit a sealing order on a non-dispositive motion.
- 5 See, e.g., Pac. Gas & Elec. Co. v. Lynch, 216 F. Supp. 2d 1016, 1027 (N.D. Cal. 2002).

TESTIMONY AND DOCUMENTS DESIGNATED BY RIMINI AS CONFIDENTIAL OR HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY

Defendants have designated the following materials cited or referred to in Oracle's Opposition as Confidential or Highly Confidential – Attorneys' Eyes Only:

| 11 | EX. NO. | DESCRIPTION | CONF. DESIGN. |
|------------|------------|--|------------------|
| 12 | 1 | Email from Dan Slarve to Seth Ravin, which has been marked as | Highly |
| | | PTX 2. | Confidential |
| 13 | 2 | Email from Doug Baron to Dennis Chiu, copying George Lester, | Highly |
| 14 | | which has been marked as PTX 13. | Confidential |
| 14 | 3 | Email chain from Shelley Blackmarr to Beth Lester, copying | Highly |
| 15 | | Susan Tahtaras, which has been marked as PTX 1585. | Confidential |
| | 4 | Email from Susan Tahtaras to Beth Lester, which has been marked | Highly |
| 16 | | as PTX 14. | Confidential |
| 17 | 5 | Email from Dennis Chiu to George Lester copying Beth Lester, | Highly |
| 17 | | which has been marked as PTX 17. | Confidential |
| 18 | 6 | Email from Dennis Chiu to George Lester copying Seth Ravin, | Confidential |
| 10 | | Davivhick, which has been marked as PTX 20. | |
| 19 | 7 | Email from Seth Ravin to George Lester, which has been marked | Confidential |
| 20 | | as PTX 21. | |
| 20 | 8 | Email chain from Dennis Chiu to Seth Ravin copying George | Highly |
| 21 | | Lester, Thomas Shay, which has been marked as PTX 22. | Confidential |
| 4 1 | 9 | Email chain from Rich Hughes to Trey Picard, which has been | Highly |
| 22 | | marked as PTX 24. | Confidential |
| | 10 | Email chain from Dennis Chiu to Seth Ravin copying George | Highly |
| 23 | | Lester, Thomas Shay, which has been marked as PTX 27. | Confidential |
| 24 | 11 | Email from Rusty Gaston to Michael Davichick, which has been | Highly |
| 4 | | marked as PTX 4937. | Confidential |
| 25 | 12 | Response to Request for Proposal prepared for Abilene | Highly |
| | | Independent School District, which has been marked as PTX 2140. | Confidential |
| 26 | 13 | Email from Dennis Chiu to Seth Ravin and Brian Slepko copying | Highly |
| 27 | | Michael Davichick and Beth Lester, which has been marked as PTX 601. | Confidential |

6

7

8

9

10

| 1 | 14 | Email from J.R. Corpuz to Doug Baron, which has been marked as | Highly |
|----|----|---|-----------------|
| 2 | | PTX 34. | Confidential |
| 2 | 15 | Email from Seth Ravin to Michael Davichick, which has been | Highly |
| 3 | | marked as PTX 35. | Confidential |
| | 16 | Email from Michael Davichick to Jim Ward, which has been | Confidential & |
| 4 | | marked as PTX 36. | Confidential by |
| _ | | | Oracle |
| 5 | 17 | Email from Susan Tahtaras to Tim Conley, which has been marked | Highly |
| _ | | as PTX 40. | Confidential |
| 6 | 18 | Email from John Whittenbarger to Dennis Chiu, et al., which has | Highly |
| _ | | been marked as PTX 42. | Confidential |
| 7 | 19 | Email from Brian Slepko to Seth Ravin, which has been marked as | |
| O | 1) | PTX 229. | Highly |
| 8 | 20 | | Confidential |
| 9 | 20 | Email from Susan Tahtaras to David Radtke, which has been | Highly |
| 9 | | marked as PTX 41. | Confidential |
| 10 | 21 | Email from Chris Limburg to Krista Williams, which has been marked as PTX 53. | Confidential |
| 11 | 22 | Email from Michael Davichick to Chip Seigel and Kim Cabada, | Highly |
| 11 | | which has been marked as PTX 56. | Confidential |
| 12 | 23 | Email from Krista Williams to Dennis Chiu, which has been | Highly |
| 12 | | marked as PTX 57. | Confidential |
| 13 | 24 | | |
| 13 | 24 | Email from Brian Slepko to Dennis Chiu, which has been marked as PTX 58. | Highly |
| 14 | | | Confidential |
| | 25 | Email from Ray Grigsby to Conrad Bredleau, et. al., which has | Highly |
| 15 | | been marked as PTX 61. | Confidential |
| | 26 | Email from Krista Williams to Dennis Chiu, which has been | Highly |
| 16 | | marked as PTX 63. | Confidential |
| | 27 | Email from Ed Freeman to Krista Williams, which has been | Highly |
| 17 | | marked as PTX 64. | Confidential |
| 18 | 28 | Excerpts from the deposition of Krista Williams, taken on October 5, 2011. | Confidential |
| 19 | 33 | Excerpts from the deposition of YUM! Restaurant Services, Inc.'s corporate representative, James Ward, taken on December 9, 2011. | Confidential |
| 20 | | | |

Oracle has submitted all other exhibits in the Appendix to the Court's public files, which would allow public access to all Exhibits except for the items listed above. Accordingly, the request to seal is narrowly tailored.

For the foregoing reasons, Oracle respectfully requests that the Court find that good cause exists to file under seal the unredacted copies of the Opposition and above-listed Exhibits, and to issue an order sealing the same.

| 1 | DATED: July 16, 2015 | BOIES SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP |
|----------|----------------------|--|
| 2 | | |
| 3 | | By: <u>/s/ Kieran P. Ringgenberg</u> |
| 4 | | Kieran P. Ringgenberg Attorneys for Plaintiffs |
| 5 | | Oracle USA, Inc., Oracle America, Inc., |
| 6 | | and Oracle International Corp. |
| 7 | | |
| 8 | | |
| 9 | | |
| 10 | | |
| 11 | | |
| 12 | | |
| 13 | | |
| 14 15 | | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | | |
| 27 | | |
| 28 | | 4 Case No. 2:10-cv-00106-LRH-PAL |
| | | 4 Case 100. 2.10-cv-00100-LRH-PAL |

| 1 | ATTESTATION OF FILER | | |
|----|---|-----|--|
| 2 | The signatory to this document is Kieran Ringgenberg, and I have obtained Mr. | | |
| 3 | Ringgenberg's concurrence to file this document on his behalf. | | |
| 4 | Data de July 16, 2015 | | DOIEG COULLED & ELEVNED LLD |
| 5 | Dated: July 16, 2015 |) | BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP |
| 6 | 1 | By: | Steven C. Holtzman Steven C. Holtzman, Esq. (pro hac vice) |
| 7 | | | 1999 Harrison Street, Suite 900 Oakland, CA 94612 |
| 8 | | | Telephone: (510) 874-1000 Facsimile: (510) 874-1460 |
| 9 | | | kringgenberg@bsfllp.com Attorneys for Plaintiffs |
| 10 | | | Attorneys for 1 tulliffs |
| 11 | | | |
| 12 | | | |
| 13 | | | |
| 14 | | | |
| 15 | | | |
| 16 | | | |
| 17 | | | |
| 18 | | | |
| 19 | | | |
| 20 | | | |
| 21 | | | |
| 22 | | | |
| 23 | | | |
| 24 | | | |
| 25 | | | |
| 26 | | | |
| 27 | | | |
| 28 | | 5 | Case No. 2:10-cv-00106-LRH-PAL |
| | | J | 2 2.10 0, 00100 2.111 1712 |

| 1 | <u>CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE</u> | | |
|----|--|--|--|
| 2 | I hereby certify that on the 16th day of July, 2015, I electronically transmitted the | | |
| 3 | foregoing PLAINTIFFS ORACLE'S MOTION TO SEAL THEIR OPPOSITION TO | | |
| 4 | DEFENDANTS RIMINI STREET INC.'S AND SETH RAVIN'S MOTION BIFURCATE | | |
| 5 | AND SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS to the Clerk's Office using the CM/ECF System for | | |
| 6 | filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to all counsel in this matter; all counsel | | |
| 7 | being registered to receive Electronic Filing. | | |
| 8 | | | |
| 9 | /s/ Catherine Duong | | |
| 10 | An employee of Boies, Schiller & Flexner LLP | | |
| 11 | | | |
| 12 | | | |
| 13 | | | |
| 14 | | | |
| 15 | | | |
| 16 | | | |
| 17 | | | |
| 18 | | | |
| 19 | | | |
| 20 | | | |
| 21 | | | |
| 22 | | | |
| 23 | | | |
| 24 | | | |
| 25 | | | |
| 26 | | | |
| 27 | | | |
| 28 | Case No. 2:10-cv-00106-LRH-PAL | | |
| | | | |